Planning for Food Justice: Advancing Equity and Food Access in Land Use Planning in California with SB 1000

> Charisma Acey, Ph.D. Berkeley Food Institute University of California, Berkeley

> > Prepared for: UC Center Sacramento October 4, 2023

Introduction – Environmental Justice





CBE members demonstrate how to monitor air quality at AB&I during a Land Use and Built Environment Tour of East Oakland.



Introduction Food security

The U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) defines food insecurity as "lack of consistent access to enough food for every person in a household to live an active, healthy life."

Community food security **links food availability**, **access and utilization to regional land use**, **transportation and public health**. It highlights inequalities in which groups lack continuous physical and economic access to enough nutrient-rich, healthy and culturally relevant food, and to food production avenues that could contribute to active, healthy living and environments.

Challenges to accessing healthy food can lead to a higher risk of chronic diseases such as obesity, heart disease, and type 2 diabetes; when people cannot get to grocery stores that sell healthy foods or have opportunity to grow or to obtain locally grown foods, they may shop at nearby corner stores, which often carry foods high in fat, sugar, and sodium and fewer healthy options like fresh produce.



Connecting Food Justice and Environmental Justice (1)

Food Justice and environmental justice are, social movements that connect system-wide factors affecting human health and well-being. Both movements have also begun to reshape the discourse of sustainable agriculture, environmentalism and social justice advocacy.



Connecting Food Justice and Environmental Justice (2)

Our research reemphasizes this argument: As cities and counties incorporate EJ into land use planning, SB 1000 provides an important avenue for advancing food justice throughout the state.



CalEnviroScreen 4.0

https://oehha.ca.gov/calenviroscreen/maps-data

What is SB 1000? The Planning for Healthy

Communities Act

Signed into law September 2016

Requires Cities with Disadvantaged Communities (DACs) to incorporate Environmental Justice Policies into their General Plans

Cities with DACs must include Environmental Justice Policies when **two** or more **elements of their General Plan** are updated **concurrently** beginning in January 2018.

1000 of SB oals 7

1	Reduce Pollution Exposure
2	Promote Public Facilities
3	Promote Food Access
4	Promote Safe and Sanitary Homes
5	Promote Physical Activity
6	Promote Community Engagement
7	Prioritize Programs that address DCAs needs
8	Equitable Development and Design
9	Reduce Climate Change Impacts

EXAMPLE POLICIES

1	Reduce Pollution Exposure	 Reduce water contamination Separate the source of pollution from sensitive land uses or populations
2	Promote Public Facilities	 Provide equitable distribution/access from underserved areas Meet future demands of underserved communities Utilize a multi-benefit implementation approach
3	Promote Food Access	 Create opportunities to access affordable and nutritious foods Protect and expand urban agriculture Set up school programs that integrate gardening and nutrition
4	Promote Safe and Sanitary Homes	 Address unhealthy housing conditions Address Housing Affordability Promote land use compatibility
5	Promote Physical Activity	 Improve access and connectivity Promote urban greening Implement complete streets
6	Promote Community Engagement	 Promote capacity-building Ensure cultural considerations Accommodate language access
7	Prioritize Programs that address DCAs needs	 Support a strong, diverse local business community Consider environmental justice issues in the equitable provision of public amenities that improve the quality of life
8	Equitable Development and Design	 Promote community-oriented development Improve community economic health Promote workforce development
9	Reduce Climate Change Impacts	 Minimize greenhouse gas emissions Increase renewable energy and access Promote energy efficiency

Goals of SB 1000



Examples of Equity Geographies



Canyon

Research Questions

- How is the food access focus implemented in cities general plas under SB 1000?
- What kind of SB 1000 food access projects, policies, and/or programs are being implemented in the study cities (Richmond and Gilroy)?
- What level of engagement did community members have in the planning and implementation of these SB 1000 food access projects, policies, and/or programs?
- What other factors influenced which projects, policies, and/or programs were implemented?

Data Collection Methodology

Locate General Plan & Associated Updates Search General Plan for Keywords Categorize Existing Food Policies

Looked for the most recent versions of each cities general plans, housing elements, and any articles or press releases referring to an upcoming environmental justice element if SB 1000 had not yet been implemented Searched documents for terms like "food", "market", "agriculture", "garden", "health" and "groceries" to identify food related policies included in the general plan Once food policies had been identified, added them to the SB 1000 database and categorized them based on what issues the policies addressed (i.e. food access, nutrition, local food production, edible landscapes, protection of agricultural land, and equity

Data Collection Methodology (Continued)

1	Food Access	Policies reduce distance and barriers to grocery stores, farmers markets, and other
2	Nutrition Outcomes	Policies increase healthy food access in turn improving nutrition outcomes
3 Local Food Production		Policy promotes urban agriculture and other forms of local food production, distribution, and sale
4	Edible Landscapes	Policies provide public access to produce through street trees, community gardens and other communal sources
5	Protection of Agricultural Land	Policy prevents the conversion of agricultural land to urban uses
6	Equity Focus	Policy includes specific focus on vulnerable populations or disadvantaged communities

Column	Meaning			
Location	Name of California municipality			
County	Name of County that municipality is in			
Last Updated	Date that General Plan was last updated or if an update is currently in progress			
Link to Plan	Link to General Plan			
SB 1000	Has the General Plan addressed the requirements of SB 1000?			
	 Yes: SB 1000 is included in the General Plan No: SB 1000 is not included in General Plan despite the fact that the law has been triggered In Progress: Municipality is currently working on General Plan update Law has not been triggered: City has not updated two or more elements of their General Plan concurrently since SB 1000 went into effect Not Mentioned: Municipality is working on General Plan update, but SB 1000 is not mentioned in planning documents 			
EJ Element	Is there a specific EJ element or is environmental justice incorporated throughout the document?			
	Yes: There is a standalone EJ Element Incorporated Throughout: EJ Policies are integrated throughout General plan N/A: Need for Implementation of EJ Element has not yet been triggered Unclear: Update is in progress. This could mean it is unclear if policies will be incorporated throughout or in a stand alone element OR it is unclear if EJ will be incorporated at all			
In Compliance	Is the city in complance with SB 1000?			
	Yes: Law has not been triggered, EJ policies are in progress, or EJ policies exist No: City is out of compliance with SB 1000 (Two or more elements have been updated concurrently since SB 1000 went into effect) Unclear: City is currently updating General Plan, but SB 1000 is not mentioned in published update information			
Agricultural Community?	Does the municipality have a strong link to agriculture production?			

Location	County	Last Updated	Link to Plan	SB 1000	EJ Element?	In Compliance?	Agricultural Community?	Policy	Description	Food Access	Nutrition Outcomes	Local Food Production	Edible Landscapes Protect A cricolityral Land	Adresses Equity	Policy Goals Addressed:											
			https://www.cityof blythe.ca.gov/Docu					OS-2	Minimize conflicts between urban and agricultural uses by requiring buffers and greenbelts.				x													
Blythe	Riverside	2007	mentCenter/View/1 <u>815/Housing-Elem</u> ent-Presentation?bi <u>dId=</u>		n/a	yes ye	yes	A-9	Promote continued agricultural use of important farmland outside the urhan area.				x		1/6											
Brawley	Imperial	Updated more than 2 elements	https://www.brawle y-ca.gov/cms/kcfin der/upload/files/pla nning/CAP%20Bra wley%20General%	no	no	no	Farmland, F RME-8.1.1 Farmland, ar State and Fe	ves All Important Farmland, including the categories of Prime Farmland, Farmland of Statewide Importance, Unique Farmland, and Farmland of Local Importance, as defined by State and Federal agencies, outside the City's boundaries shoul be reserved for agricultural uses.				x		1/6												
		of general plan in 2019	20Plan%20Amend ments%20-%20No					RME-8.1.2	Encourage infill development and establish buffers between agricultural and nonagricultural uses.				x													
			<u>v%202019-%20FI</u> <u>NAL.pdf</u>				R		Prohibit "leapfrogging" or checkerboard patterns of non-agricultural development in designated agricultural areas.				x													
Brea	Orange	2003	https://shapebrea.n et/housing-element -update	Law has not been triggered	n/a	yes	no								0/6											
								EJ-2.1	Support projects, policies and programs which encourage convenient access to healthy foods in all neighborhoods and districts.	x	x			x												
			https://cms7files1.r evize.com/buenapa rkca/Document_ce nter/City%20Depar																EJ-2.2	Promote statewide efforts to expand usage of food assistance benefits (e.g., CalFresh, WIC, and Market Match) at farmers' markets and local retailers.	x				x	
			tments/Community																102.007	EJ-2.3	Continue to support and encourage the operation of farmers' markets in the City	x				
	Orange January 2022 January					x				4/6																
DATA	DAJE J		Plan/BP%20EJ% Draft%20Eleme nt%20adopted.pdf					EJ-2.5	Support projects, policies and programs which encourage existing liquor stores, convenience stores, and ethnic markets to stock fresh produce and other healthy foods.	x	x															

FINDINGS

228 California Cities with Disadvantaged Communities

Out of Compliance

5



94 Law has not been Triggered

55 EJ Policies in Progress (SB 1000)

66 EJ Policies Incorporated (SB 1000)

EXAMPLE POLICIES

- (Richmond EJ-3.A) Leverage financial incentives, zoning, technical assistance, and other similar programs to attract grocery store retailers in underserved residential areas of the city. Periodically update information on the location of healthy food sources to track progress on meeting the goals of this element and the Community Health and Wellness Element.
- (San Pablo HEA-I-18) Seek ways to partner with regional Community Supported Agriculture (CSA) as an alternative source of fresh and healthy fruits and vegetables for San Pablo residents, particularly those with limited mobility, limited income, or those furthest from existing grocery stores.
- (Fresno HC-5a) Adopt regulations and incentives in the Development Code for locating healthy food grocery stores to increase communitywide healthy food access, with an emphasis on the attraction of grocery stores to established neighborhoods deficient in grocery stores and access to healthy and fresh food.
- (Los Angeles H-P46) Create a corner neighborhood market conversion program to increase access to fresh, affordable, and healthy food while promoting small business development through convenience stores, corner markets and neighborhood markets. Program implementation shall be targeted in the most underserved neighborhoods, shall prioritize partnering with public health, food retail and community- organizing experts, and promote strategies to ensure that healthy foods are prominently placed, priced competitively and look attractive to encourage consumer towards healthier eating in retail outlets for sustainable impact. Program participants shall be required to accept CalFresh EBT and WIC





EXAMPLE POLICIES

Richmond-

"Leverage financial incentives, zoning, technical assistance, and other similar programs to attract grocery store retailers in underserved residential areas of the city. Periodically update information on the location of healthy food sources to track progress on meeting the goals of this element and the Community Health and Wellness Element."

San Pablo-

"Seek ways to partner with regional Community Supported Agriculture (CSA) as an alternative source of fresh and healthy fruits and vegetables for San Pablo residents, particularly those with limited mobility, limited income, or those furthest from existing grocery stores."

Anaheim-

"Support the establishment of farmer's markets, farm stands, neighborhood markets, mobile health food markets, and other stores that sell healthy food and fresh produce, to expand access to healthy food options throughout the city, with a focus on locations within a walkable distance (i.e., half to a quarter mile away) of EJ Communities."

FINDINGS

Goals Addressed and Incorporation Type



Difference is Statistically Significant at the 95% Confidence Interval (z= 2.14987)

TABLE 2. FOOD POLICY GOALS IN GENERAL PLANS AND IMPLEMENTATION OF SB 1000

Policy Goal Addressed	Total # of cities that have implemented SB 1000	Cities with goal who have not implemented SB 1000	% of total (t=163)	Cities with goal who have implemented SB 1000	% of total (t=65)	Difference between % with and without SB 1000	Z-score	P-value
Food Access	111	52	31.9%	59	90.8%	+58.9%	8.03299	<.00001*
Nutrition	92	37	22.7%	55	84.6%	+61.9%	8.6011	<.00001*
Food Production	119	63	38.6%	56	86.1%	+47.5%	6.4819	<.00001*
Edible Landscapes	61	25	15.3%	36	55.4%	+40.1%	6.1767	<.00001*
Agricultural Land	95	73	44.7%	22	33.8%	-11.0%	-1.5075	0.13167
Equity	80	26	16.0%	54	83.1%	+67.1%	9.69	<.00001*

*Statistically significant at the 99th percentile.

CASE STUDIES





CASE STUDIES

3 Interviews:*

RICHMOND

- 1 City Council Member
- 1 Consultant on 2012 Health and Wellness Plan
- 1 Representative from a Community
 Organization

6 Interviews:*

- 2 former Gilroy City Planners
- 2 Consultants for 2020 General Plan
 Update
- 2 Representatives from Community Organizations

GILROY

Richmond and Gilroy Case Studies

Richmond

- Urban Community, Bay Area
- General Plan last updated 2012 incorporated health and wellness element
- In October 2022, Richmond built off this element to amend its plan with an EJ element

Gilroy

- Agricultural Community, Bay Area
- EJ Element Implemented 2020
- Policies that address equity, food access, nutrition, local food production and protection of agricultural land

PREVALENCE OF FOOD JUSTICE POLICIES IN SF BAY AREA GENERAL PLANS



*Disadvantaged Communities are defined in CalEnviroScreen 4.0 and are pursuant to SB535. For more info: https://ochha.ca.gov/calenviroscreen/sb535











NUMBER OF FOOD POLICIES IMPLEMENTED



 \checkmark USDA Low Income Low Food Access



RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1. Implement a standalone environmental justice element rather than incorporate goals throughout so food does not get lost.
- 2. Ensure widespread awareness and participation in creating the EJ element, and that final goals are communicated to community members.
- 3. Improve the general plan process to encourage follow-through and onthe-ground implementation of stated goals.
- 4. Include USDA food access metrics when defining "disadvantaged communities."
- 5. Provide example food policies to cities that are actionable, targeted, and specific.
- 6. Explicitly prioritize racial equity in environmental and food justice planning.



DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

BEST PRACTICES FOR IMPLEMENTING SB 1000

New Guidance from the OAG

Emerging Best Practices

Oakland EJ Food Policies

Goal 4: SUPPORT A FOOD SYSTEM THAT PROVIDES NUTRITIOUS, AFFORDABLE, CULTURALLY RELEVANT, AND AFFORDABLE FOOD TO ALL OAKLANDERS.



Goal 4 - Policies related to Improving Food Access

sed City Policies	What we've heard
New Healthy Food Grocers. Leverage tax and fee deferral/reduction, California Food Financing Initiative funding, and other economic development grant monies to attract new healthy food grocers and co-ops and help them establish and/or make necessary improvements.	 Expanding Healthy Food Access: Include data points that speak to community health: daily consumption of fresh fruits and vegetables, community gardens, county -level Cal Fresh participation, and county -level data from Healthy Stores for a Healthy Community.

- Explore potential locations to prioritize new full -service grocery store development in EJ **communities** with the lowest food access. Incentivize community -led, neighborhood resident -owned and cooperatively -owned grocery stores.
- Community Gardens Program. Partner with nonprofits, especially indigenous groups, to expand the City's Community Gardens Program in areas with low food access, with policies to address maintenance and permit Indigenous community harvesting/ foraging of parks.

Ensure neighborhood access to produce on a block -by-block basis with produce trucks coming by at regular times. Support more brick -and-mortar businesses selling healthy food

- Don't attract corporate chain health food stores and other • high-end grocers to EJ Communities. Support small, local, resident -owned businesses.
- Work with community -serving food businesses to identify • and remove bureaucratic barriers to community -owned grocery stores.
- Dedicate additional significant and ongoing funding for City • staff FTE for maintaining community gardens.

Goal 4 - Policies related to Improving Food Access

Proposed City Policies	What we've heard				
• Community and Home Gardening. Support community and home gardening efforts and – particularly in EJ Communities underserved by healthy food retail – by providing financial incentives such as land transfers and technical assistance in the form of online and library resources and workshops on gardening basics and cooking easy, healthy meals with fresh produce.	 REIA Collaborate with Economic and Workforce Dept. and food justice CBOs to facilitate easy and affordable permitting for unpermitted healthy food vendors, connect with them in their language(s), and support their business development. Enter long -term contracts with small caterers to provide meals in food deserts. Enable small businesses to hire additional staff members with livable wages and benefits. 				
• Entrepreneurship and Food Innovation. Support innovative food entrepreneurship, like street vending and food cooperatives. Promote indoor produce farming in industrial zones.	 Support summer internships for high school students in EJ Communities to receive culinary training across Oakland, particularly in Deep East Oakland. 				

Goal 4 - Policies related to Improving Food Access

Proposed City Policies	What we've heard				
• Promote permitting for preparation, cooking, and serving food to consumers on the same day from a private residence. Focus outreach in EJ communities that could benefit from a source of healthy food and entrepreneurship opportunities. Reduce permit fee for income - qualified individuals.	 REIA Waive vacancy taxes if the property is put to agricultural use, enable low -income residents of EJ Communities to develop community gardens, w/o requirement of a City permit. Allow the planting urban fruit trees in public parks and other areas where it is safe to do so. Collaborate w/ residents and 				
• Community Gardens Initiative. Acquire land for public community gardens and collaborate with EJ community groups, schools, and food justice/urban farming organizations to steward gardens.	 food justice CBOs to implement solutions that minimize the liability of growing fruit - or nut -bearing trees on public land. Support residential fruit tree -planting and stewardship efforts in Deep East Oakland. Establish edible gardens at school sites for children's hands - on education with secured funding for additional staffing. 				

Integrate food harvested from school gardens and nearby farms, ranches, and fisheries into meal plans.

Goal 4 - Policies related to Food Assistance and Nutrition Programs

Proposed City Policies	What we've heard
Food Assistance Programs. Increase awareness and participation in federal food assistance programs (ex. SNAP).	 DR Engagement Engage with HOPE Collaborative and Oakland Food Policy Council REIA
 Food Security Resources & Partnerships. Coordinate with organizations and public agencies to connect residents to federal, state, and local food programs and emergency food assistance. Ensure all food insecure residents, regardless of legal status, are provided food and benefits. Expand the Alameda County Foodbank's hours during emergencies. 	 Promote use of CalFresh and the Double Up Food Bucks program, that doubles produce budgets for low -income, food -insecure customers. Support additional Fresh 5x programs for local grocers to supplement CalFRESH and CalSNAP benefits with a 5:1 cash match incentive for low -income residents. Support grocery and corner stores in enabling use of EBT CalFresh benefits for acquiring hot, prepared meals, and quality, organic bulk foods in quart -size portions that could be sold to -go for heating up and eating at home. Provide unrestricted, substantial, and regular cash benefits through Saba Food Cards to low -income, food -insecure

program.

residents of EJ Communities. Expand qualifications to the

Goal 4 - Policies related to Food Assistance and Nutrition Programs

oposed City Policies	What we've heard
• Education and Awareness. Develop educational materials promoting healthy foods, and share these with Oakland Unified and community organizations. Support organizations with financial incentives, like discounted water rates.	 Wark with easiel justice CROs and law, income residents of El.
	 Work with social justice CBOs and low -income residents of EJ Communities to co -develop language for an Ordinance to continue and expand Phase 2 of the Oakland Resilient Families (ORF) pilot program to a fully-fledged, opt -out Universal Basic Income program that is

• Co-develop language for an Ordinance to increase Oakland's minimum wage (Measure FF, 2014) to a living wage.

accessible to all lower -income residents of Oakland.

Goal 4 - Policies related to Food Assistance and Nutrition Programs

roposed City Policies	What we've heard		
• Incentivize Healthy Food Stock. Create a program to incentivize and assist business owners to stock affordable, fresh, and healthy food in underserved areas, prioritizing local resident -owned businesses. For ex. funding for refrigeration equipment.	 REIA Pass a "Healthy Food Zones" Ordinance restricting new fast -food establishments near schools and in residential EJ Communities. Support Saba Grocers Initiative with their efforts to increase storage and wholesale capacity for corner stores in low -income EJ Communities. 		
• New Innovative Businesses. Promote creation of local businesses that sell produce in areas where healthy food access is limited, including food innovations.	 Support additional BIPOC -owned and -run Food Hubs for food assistance and education organizations in EJ Communities. Establish a Good Food Purchasing Program for OUSD schools. All public -school food contracts should provide children with fresh, nutritious, and culturally appropriate meals. Explore contracting with parents of students to cook culturally appropriate meals for students in schools as a structural change. Many parents are experienced cooks and want to cook fresh, healthy, culturally relevant food for the students in school kitchens. 		

Goal 4 - Policies related to Food Recovery

Proposed City Policies	What we've heard
• Food Recovery Program. Increase capacity of organizations to recover and distribute edible food that is otherwise wasted. For example, exploring potential agroforestry locations in the community.	 REIA Reroute and repurpose all edible food to nourish those who need it most while it is still good to eat, at reduced costs and for free. Establish food recovery programs to enable grassroots food justice CBOs to collect surplus edible food from the City, large businesses, and anchor institutions like universities. Support the development of community Food Hubs in EJ Communities, with amenities such as community fridges for free food or produce distribution, free cooking workshops and a catering space.

What's Next?

- Continue to track EJ and Food Justice through SB 1000 implementation, esp. food access and in farmworker communities
- Measure the impact of SB 1000 implementation, changing policies, funding, practices, conditions on the ground, health outcomes
- Engage with communities across California on the implications of SB 1000 and other EJ laws and funding to improve food access, food security and food justice.

Acknowledgements

Research Team Members: Susana Matias, Ph.D., UC Berkeley, BFI and UCANR Katherine Fallon, MCP, BCDC

Sponsorship: Berkeley Food Institute Hellman Foundation

Community: City of Gilroy City of Richmond City of Oakland Just Cities Deeply Rooted Collaborative

Thank you!

Charisma Acey charisma.acey@berkeley.edu

https://food.berkeley.edu